



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

January 17, 2025
Date

382
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a special meeting January 17, 2025, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the conference room of the offices of the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma and at the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, January 15, 2025, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on January 13, 2025, and posted to the REAB website on January 15, 2025. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

Aaron S. Emerson
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Richard Broughton
Brandon J. Witt
Michael Willard
Alex Trinidad
Davonna Milam

Board members excused: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; Rex Duncan and Ashley Scott.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the December 6, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Willard. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **Public Hearing regarding Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:10-1-6, Experience Prerequisite; OAC 600:10-1-7, Continuing Education; and OAC 600:10-1-12, Inactive Status – Annual Fee Payment, as posted in the November 7, 2024, Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State's Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 2, 2024.** (No comments were received, and the hearing was closed).
- IV. **Discussion and possible action regarding public comments, potential amendments and the Adoption of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:10-1-6, Experience Prerequisite; OAC 600:10-1-7, Continuing Education; and OAC 600:10-**

1-12, Inactive Status – Annual Fee Payment, as posted in the November 7, 2024 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 2, 2024, following a Public Hearing held on January 17, 2025. (Exhibit “C”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the proposed rules listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- V. **Public Hearing regarding Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:15-1-2, Definitions, as posted in the November 7, 2024, Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 2, 2024. (No comments were received, and the hearing was closed).**

- VI. **Discussion and possible action regarding public comments, potential amendments, and the Adoption of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:15-1-2, Definitions, as posted in the November 7, 2024, Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 2, 2024, following a Public Hearing held on January 17, 2025. (Exhibit “D”)**

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the proposed rules listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- IX. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Order as to Complaint #23-011; in the Matter of Daniel E. Simon; to Include any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit “E”)**

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Rex Duncan, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT.** (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT. (No Report)

DIRECTOR’S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due October 31, 2024.** (Exhibit “F”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to suspend each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director’s Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due from February 28, 2025, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit “G”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director’s Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** (Exhibit “H”)

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a certificate of registration for appraisal management companies to the applicant listed in Agenda Item VII, Director’s Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by February 28, 2025, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit “I”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS.

A. **Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding the appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. A. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals.** (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "L")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (No report)

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)

C. Legislation & Rules Committee.

Ashley Scott presented a legislative report for the 2025 legislative session, to include pending bills that affect the Board.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding the appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. D. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Broughton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-021, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-022, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-023, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-024, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A24-025, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that a Letter of Warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, except any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through N.




AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD


JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD