



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

October 4, 2024
Date

379
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting October 4, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma and at the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, October 2, 2024, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on September 27, 2024, and posted to the REAB website on October 2, 2024. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Aaron S. Emerson
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Richard Broughton
Brandon J. Witt
Michael Willard
Alex Trinidad

Board members excused: Glen Mulready
Davonna Milam

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; and Rex Duncan.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Broughton moved that the reading of the minutes of the September 6, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Witt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **Introduction of Rex Duncan as Prosecuting Attorney for the Real Estate Appraiser Board.**

Rex Duncan introduced himself to the board.

- IV. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Recommendation of Dismissal By the Board's Prosecutor as to Complaint #23-045; in the Matter of John H. Jones; to include any Associated Matters or Motions.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Rex Duncan, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Recommendation listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Order as to Complaint #23-044; in the Matter of Christopher J. Rossi; to include any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit “D”)

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Rex Duncan, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Order as to Complaint #23-019; in the Matter of Cassie A. Everett; to include any Associated Matters or Motions.

Tabled to November agenda.

VI. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT. (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT. (No Report)

DIRECTOR’S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due July 31, 2024.** (Exhibit “E”)

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due from November 30, 2024 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit “F”)

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit “G”)**

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a certificate of registration for appraisal management companies to the applicant listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by November 30, 2024 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit “H”)**

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **COMMITTEE REPORTS.**

A. **Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)**

B. **Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit “I”)**

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit “J”)

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (No Report)

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit “K”)

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-012, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-013, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-014, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-015, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-016, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-017, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-019, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-020, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Proposed Regular Session Meeting Dates for Calendar Year 2025. (Exhibit “L”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the proposed regular session meeting dates as presented in Agenda Item VIII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding New Reconsideration of Value Rules set Forth by the CFPB and Adopted by FHA, Fannie Mae, and Freddie Mac and the Possible Impact on the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board.

Board members discussed Agenda Item IX.

XI. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.



A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Aaron S. Emerson", written over a horizontal line.

AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Jenelle LePoint", written over a horizontal line.

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD