



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

July 12, 2024
Date

377
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting July 12, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma and at the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors at 220 N.E. 28th St, Ste 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, July 10, 2024, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on July 5, 2024, and posted to the REAB website on July 10, 2024. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

Aaron S. Emerson
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Richard Broughton
Brandon J. Witt
Michael Willard
Alex Trinidad
Davonna Milam

Board members excused: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; Stephen McCaleb and Kelly White.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the April 5, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- VIII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING REPRESENTATION BY THE ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE AS TO SERVICES OF BOARD PROSECUTOR BEGINNING JULY 1, 2024** (Exhibit "C")

No action was taken.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF AUBREY J. DOBBS; COMPLAINT #23-021; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JOE GIBSON; COMPLAINT #23-018 AND COMPLAINT #23-033; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson made several announcements.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due January 31, 2024.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due from June 30, 2024 through August 31, 2024 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a certificate of registration for appraisal management companies to the applicant listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by June 30, 2024, July 31, 2024 and August 31, 2024 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. COMMITTEE REPORTS.

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "K")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given the authority to issue a renewal certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(D) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to allow staff to be given the authority to issue a renewal certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(E) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to issue a renewal certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. E. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "L")

(A) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 4. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-002, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-004, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-003, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-005, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A24-006, Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A24-007, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-008, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-009, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-010, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #24-011, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Review of Draft Suggested Changes to OAC 600, Chapter 15-1-2 Definitions.** (Exhibit "O")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the recommended changes as presented in Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Approval of Budget for Fiscal Year 2025 to include any Associated Matters or Motions.** (Exhibit "P")

After a brief discussion, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the FY2025 Budget listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. **Report of Attendees at the Spring Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulator Officials in Nashville, Tennessee between May 3 and May 5, 2024.**

Board members discussed their attendance at the Spring Conference listed in Agenda Item X.

XI. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through P.



AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD