



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

April 5, 2024
Date

376
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting April 5, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, April 3, 2024, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on March 28, 2024, and posted to the REAB website on April 3, 2024. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Glen Mulready
Aaron S. Emerson
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Richard Broughton
Brandon J. Witt
Michael Willard
Alex Trinidad

Board members excused: Davonna Milam

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; Stephen McCaleb; Jon Huntington; Rick Tucker; George Johnson and GeAndra Johnson.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Broughton moved that the reading of the minutes of the March 1, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Witt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JENNIFER D. RAHLF; COMPLAINT #23-004; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Witt is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT. (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT. (No Report)

DIRECTOR’S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due January 31, 2024.** (Exhibit “D”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by May 31, 2024 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit “E”)

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director’s Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** (No Report)

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by May 31, 2024, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit “F”)

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item IV, Director’s Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS.

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to issue a renewal certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (No Report)

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievances #23-045, #23-047, and #23-048, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson that the grievances be consolidated under #23-045 and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Disciplinary Hearing Panel Recommendation in the Matter of George M. Johnson and Jim L. Treat; Complaint #22-037; to Include a Request for Oral Argument and any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint. Mr. Broughton recused himself.

Agenda Item IV was held to the end of the meeting to allow additional time for Mr. Treat to appear pursuant to his request for oral argument. After confirming Mr. Treat was not in attendance, and after Mr. McCaleb provided oral argument for the board and Mr. Tucker provided oral argument for Mr. Johnson, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Trinidad to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Mulready	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Trinidad to approve the Hearing Panel Recommendation as to Mr. Treat as listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to adopt the Hearing Panel's Finding of Fact and Conclusions of Law as to Mr. Johnson, and amend the recommended discipline by modifying paragraph two, page 15 & 16 of the Recommended Discipline listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Disciplinary Hearing Panel Recommendation in the Matter of Darren S. Ross; Complaint #22-039; to Include a Request for Oral Argument and any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Witt is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Mr. McCaleb and Ms. Johnson, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to adopt the Hearing Panel's Finding of Fact and Conclusions of Law and amend the recommended discipline by modifying page twenty-two of the Recommended Discipline listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. NEW BUSINESS. None.

IX. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through K.



A blue ink signature of Aaron S. Emerson, consisting of a large, stylized 'A' followed by a horizontal line.

AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A blue ink signature of Jenelle LePoint, written in a cursive style.

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD