



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

March 1, 2024
Date

375
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting March 1, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, February 28, 2024, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on February 23, 2024, and posted to the REAB website on February 28, 2024. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Aaron S. Emerson
 Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
 Richard Broughton
 Brandon J. Witt
 Michael Willard
 Alex Trinidad

Board members excused: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; Stephen McCaleb and Ashley Scott.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the February 2, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JENNIFER D. RAHLF; COMPLAINT #23-004; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Tabled to April meeting.

Davonna Milam entered the meeting.

- VII. **COMMITTEE REPORTS.**

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** (Exhibit "C")

Ashley Scott presented an update of pending bills that affect the Board.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BLAKE R. RAMBO; COMPLAINT #23-015; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Witt is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. (No Report)

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due December 31, 2023. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by April 30, 2024 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (No Report)

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by April 30, 2024, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")

(A) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "J")

(A) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. B. 4. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievances #A23-037, #A23-038, #A23-039, #A23-040, #A23-041 and #A23-042, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson that the grievances be dismissed, the files closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-044, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-043, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-046, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A24-001, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Attendance by Board Members and Board Staff at the Spring Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials to be held in Nashville, Tennessee between May 3 and May 5, 2024. (Exhibit "M")

Board members discussed their attendance at the Spring Conference listed in Agenda Item VIII.

V. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Disciplinary Hearing Panel Recommendation in the Matter of Jerry L. Sisco and Joseph L. Myers; Complaint #22-036; to Include a Request for Oral Argument and any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Witt is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

Agenda Item V was held to the end of the meeting to allow additional time for Mr. Myers to appear pursuant to his request for oral argument. After confirming Mr. Myers was not in attendance, and after Mr. McCaleb provided oral argument, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve the Hearing Panel Recommendation listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Trinidad	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. NEW BUSINESS. None.

X. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through N.



AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD