



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

December 1, 2023
Date

372
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting December 1, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, November 29, 2023, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on November 22, 2023, and posted to the REAB website on November 29, 2023. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
 Richard Broughton
 Brandon J. Witt
 Aaron S. Emerson
 Michael Willard

Board members excused: Glen Mulready
 Davonna Milam

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb and Rachel Mor.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the November 3, 2023, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. This agenda item was stricken.
X. This agenda item was stricken.
XI. This agenda item was stricken

Davonna Milam entered the meeting.

- IX. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DAWN A. ROBINSON; COMPLAINT #22-043; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Witt is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** (No Report)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. (No Report)

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due September 30, 2023.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by January 31, 2024 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** (No Report)

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by January 31, 2024, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

(A) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)

D. Probable Cause Committee.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-030A, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-030B, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-030C, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-031, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-032, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-033, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-034, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-036, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (Exhibit "J")

Following a discussion, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to replace James Artman and appoint Thomas Evans as committee member to assist on the Probable Cause Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of a Board Member as Vice-Chairman for the Calendar Year 2024.

Following a discussion, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to appoint Aaron Emerson as Vice-Chairman as listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Board Members as Co-Chairs of the Board's Three Standing Committees: Legislation & Rules Committee; Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee, and Education, Experience & Testing Committee, for the Calendar Year 2024. (Exhibit "K")

Following a discussion, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to re-appoint Davonna Milam to Legislation & Rules Committee; Richard Broughton and Brandon Witt to Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee and Shane Willard and Lee Caesar, Jr. to Education, Experience & Testing Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Individuals to Education, Experience and Testing Committee; Legislation & Rules Committee; and Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee with Concurrent Appointment as Appraiser Hearing Officers for the Calendar Year 2024. (Exhibit "L")

Following a discussion, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the individuals currently listed on the rosters for the Legislation & Rules Committee; Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee; and the Education, Experience & Testing Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Ms. Milam | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XII. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.



AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD