



STATE OF OKLAHOMA  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

September 29, 2023  
Date

370  
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting September 29, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, September 27, 2023, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on September 27, 2023, and posted to the REAB website on September 27, 2023. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

- Glen Mulready
- Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
- Richard Broughton
- Brandon J. Witt
- Aaron S. Emerson
- Davonna Milam

Board members excused: Michael Willard

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb, John Sparks and Michael Ridgeway.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the August 4, 2023, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **REQUEST BY BOARD PROSECUTOR, STEPHEN MCCALED TO ADDRESS THE BOARD REGARDING TRANSFER OF HIS PRACTICE TO ODOM & SPARKS FROM DERRYBERRY & NAIFEH AND INTRODUCTION OF ATTORNEY, JOHN SPARKS.**

Brief discussion by Mr. McCaleb and introduction of John Sparks and Michael Ridgeway.

- IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DAVID A. WAKEFIELD; COMPLAINT #22-030; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DARREN S. ROSS; COMPLAINT #22-039; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Tabled to November board meeting.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF BRYCE A. GADEN, COMPLAINT #22-012 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief by Mr. McCaleb. Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Mulready	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to adopt the Hearing Panel's Finding of Fact and Conclusions of Law and amend the recommended discipline by modifying page twenty-one paragraph two of the Recommended Discipline listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** (No Report)

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** (No Report)

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

**A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due June 30, 2023 and July 31, 2023. (Exhibit "E")**

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by October 31, 2023 and November 30, 2023, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")**

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (No Report)**

**D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by October 31, 2023 and November 30, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")**

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**XI. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Journal Entry of Judgment in the Matter of Patick S. Ryan and Chris M. Williams v. Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board in the District Court of Oklahoma County; Case # CV 2022-1986; Striking Board Order #22-013 as to Complaint #20-016 to Include Any Associated Matters or Motions. (Exhibit "H")**

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**Commissioner Mulready exited the meeting.**

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

**VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

**A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)**

**B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "I")**

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")**

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. A, B & C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")**

**(A)** Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)**

**C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)**

**D. Probable Cause Committee.**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)**

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)**

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "L")**

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-019, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-020, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-022, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-023, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Milam that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-024, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-025, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A23-026, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-027, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A23-028, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that a Letter of Warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-029, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Proposed Regular Session Board Meeting Dates for Calendar Year 2024.** (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Proposed Regular Session Meeting Dates for Calendar Year 2024 modifying the July board meeting date from July 5, 2023 to July 12, 2024 regarding Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Purchase of the 2024 Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) Manual for Board Members, Board Staff, and for Members of the Boards Committees.** (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Purchase of the 2024 USPAP Manual for Board Members, Board Staff, Board Prosecutor and Members of the Board's Committees regarding Agenda Item X. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XII. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Order in the Matter of Matthew T. McCormick, Complaint #21-039, #22-028 and #22-034; to include any Associated Matters or Motions.**

Tabled to November board meeting.

XIII. **NEW BUSINESS.** None.

IVX. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

**OFFICIAL MINUTES.**

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through N.



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Lee R. Caesar, Jr.", written above a horizontal line.

**LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Jenelle LePoint", written above a horizontal line.

**JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD