



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

August 4, 2023
Date

369
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting August 4, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, August 2, 2023, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on July 27, 2023 and posted to the REAB website on August 2, 2023. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
 Richard Broughton
 Brandon J. Witt
 Aaron S. Emerson
 Shane Willard
 Davonna Milam

Board members excused: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb, Rachel Lawrence Mor, and Justin King.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the July 7, 2023, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Milan. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF RANDY J. DAVIDSON; COMPLAINT #22-026; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar, made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes

Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DANIELLE W. BROWN; COMPLAINT #22-027; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Witt, made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF SANDRA D. COLLINS; COMPLAINT #22-029; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Broughton, made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO COMPLETE BOARD ORDERED CORRECTIVE EDUCATION PURSUANT TO BOARD ORDER #23-013 IN THE MATTER OF PATRICIA A. THOMPSON, COMPLAINT #22-011 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar, made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Motion listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due May 31, 2023.** (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by September 30, 2023, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the appraisal management companies listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by September 30, 2023, and authority to issues certificates.** (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. A. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "L")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given the authority to issue a renewal certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "M")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given the authority to deny an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (Exhibit "N")

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report)**

D. **Probable Cause Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)**

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)**

3. **Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "O")**

Mr. Witt is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-013, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the

grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-014, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that a Letter of Warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-015, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-016, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-017, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-018, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further

handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #23-021, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Attendance by Board Members and Board Staff at the Fall Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials to be Held between October 7 and October 9, 2023, at the Hilton Salt Lake City Center in Salt Lake City, Utah. (Exhibit "P")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to approve the attendance of five (5) Board Members and Board Staff at Fall Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials as presented in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.


X. NEW BUSINESS. None.

X. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through P.





LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD