



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

March 3, 2023
Date

364
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting March 3, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, March 1, 2023, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on February 24, 2023 and posted to the REAB website on March 1, 2023. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
 Richard Broughton
 Brandon J. Witt
 Aaron S. Emerson
 Michael Willard
 Danny R. Daniels
 Davonna Milam

Board members excused: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Molly Clinkscales, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb, Ashley Scott, Chris McElroy and Bryson Panas.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the February 3, 2023, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JOE GIBSON; COMPLAINT #21-030 AND COMPLAINT #21-052; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior Probable Cause Committee member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Willard to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF MICHAEL A. SCHMEDT; COMPLAINT #21-048; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Tabled to April Board Meeting

V. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** No Report

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due December 31, 2022.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to administratively suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by April 30, 2023, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the appraisal management companies listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by April 30, 2023, and authority to issues certificates. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "J")

(A) Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (Exhibit "K")

Ashely Scott discussed pending bills and current legislative matters.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (No Report)

VII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of David M. High, 13203CRA to the Real Estate Appraiser Board's Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Attendance by Board Members and Staff at the Spring Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials to be held in Savannah, Georgia Between May 9 and May 11, 2023. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow up to four Board Members or Staff to attend the Spring Conference. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding The Appraisal Foundation's First Exposure Draft to the Real Property Appraiser Qualifications Criteria dated January 31, 2023 with an Effective Date of January 1, 2025. (Exhibit "N")

Discussion regarding first exposure draft.

X. Presentation by Assistant Attorney General, Bryan Neal, and Possible Discussion, as to the Oklahoma Open Meeting Act and Open Records Act. (Exhibit "O")

Presentation by Bryan Neal.

XI. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through O.





LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD