



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

January 6, 2023
Date

362
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting January 6, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on December 29, 2022 and posted to the REAB website on January 4, 2023. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

Glen Mulready
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Richard Broughton
Brandon J. Witt
Aaron S. Emerson
Michael Willard

Board members excused:

Danny Daniels
Davonna Milam

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Dilan Lyda, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb, Ashley Scott and Joseph Myers.

II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the December 2, 2022, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JOHN SLAMONS; COMPLAINT #21-031 AND COMPLAINT #21-050; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Willard to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF U.S. REAL ESTATE SERVICES, LLC; COMPLAINT #A21-042; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

After a brief presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF MATTHEW T. MCCORMICK; COMPLAINT #21-039; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.

Mr. McCaleb advised that this matter will be consolidated with Complaint #22-028 and heard together at a later date.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JASON GEISLER; COMPLAINT #21-027 AND COMPLAINT #21-037; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "E")

After a brief presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due October 31, 2022. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to administratively suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by February 28, 2023, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the appraisal management companies listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by February 28, 2023, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "L")

(A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given the authority to issue reinstatement to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** Introduction by Ashley Scott.

D. **Probable Cause Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)**

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)
- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (No Report)

IX. Public Hearing regarding Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:10-1-6, Experience Prerequisite and OAC 600:10-1-12 Inactive Status – Annual Fee Payment, as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022. (Exhibit “M”)

No written or oral comments were received.

X. Discussion and possible action regarding public comments, potential amendments and the Adoption of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:10-1-6, Experience Prerequisite and OAC 600:10-1-12 Inactive Status – Annual Fee Payment, as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022, following a Public Hearing held on January 6, 2023.

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to adopt proposed permanent rulemaking as listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XI. Public Hearing regarding Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:15-1-15 Conditions During Suspension, as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022. (Exhibit “N”)

No written or oral comments were received.

XII. Discussion and possible action regarding public comments, potential amendments and the Adoption of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:15-1-15, Conditions During Suspension, as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State’s Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022, following a Public Hearing held on January 6, 2023.

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to adopt proposed permanent rulemaking as listed in Agenda Item XI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XIII. Public Hearing regarding Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:30-1-5 Renewal Process and OAC 600:30-1-8 Background Investigations as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the

Oklahoma Secretary of State's Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022. (Exhibit "O")

No written or oral comments were received.

XIV. Discussion and possible action regarding public comments, potential amendments and the Adoption of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking to Amend OAC 600:30-1-5 Renewal Process and OAC 600:30-1-8 Background Investigations as posted in the November 8, 2022 Notice of Proposed Permanent Rulemaking filed with the Oklahoma Secretary of State's Office of Administrative Rules and published in the Oklahoma Register on December 1, 2022, following a Public Hearing held on January 6, 2023.

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to adopt proposed permanent rulemaking as listed in Agenda Item XIII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XV. Presentation by Assistant Attorney General, Bryan Neal, and Possible Discussion, as to the Oklahoma Open Meeting Act and Open Records Act.

Tabled to February Board meeting.

XVI. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XVII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through O.



A blue ink signature of Lee R. Caesar, Jr., written in a cursive style.

LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A blue ink signature of Jenelle LePoint, written in a cursive style.

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD