



STATE OF OKLAHOMA  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

December 2, 2022  
Date

361  
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting December 2, 2022, at 9:34 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, November 30, 2022, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on November 23, 2022 and posted to the REAB website on November 30, 2022. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:        Lee R. Caesar, Jr.  
   Richard Broughton  
   Brandon J. Witt  
   Aaron S. Emerson  
   Danny R. Daniels

Board members excused:            Commissioner Mulready  
   Michael Willard

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present: Stephen McCaleb, Dawn Schramm and Rachel Mor.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the November 4, 2022, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Broughton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF LEEANN TAYLOR; COMPLAINT #21-033; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint. Quorum waived by Ms. Mor.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb and Rachel Mor, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JOHN SLAMONS; COMPLAINT #21-031 AND COMPLAINT #21-050; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

No action. Mr. McCaleb advised this matter will be set for hearing.

VI. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** No Report.

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** No Report

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due September 30, 2022.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to administratively suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by January 31, 2023, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** No Report

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by January 31, 2023, and authority to issues certificates.** (Exhibit "F")

**Davonna Milam entered the meeting.**

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicant listed in Agenda Item VI, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF GARRET S. PEARCE; COMPLAINT #21-045; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BLAKELY C. DAVIS, COMPLAINT #21-056; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATION MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Daniels to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item XII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XI. **DISCUSSION AS TO A PETITION FOR REVIEW OF FINAL AGENCY ORDER IN THE MATTER OF PATRICK S. RYAN AND CHRIS M. WILLIAMS v. OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD, FILED IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF OKLAHOMA COUNTY, CASE NO. CV-2022-1986 (REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD COMPLAINT #20-016).**

No action taken.

VII. **COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

A. **Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.**

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. **Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (No Report)

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")**

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to issue reinstatement to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No Report**

**D. Probable Cause Committee.**

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No Report**

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "J")**

Mr. Emerson is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-016, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-027, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-029, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Daniels that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-030, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-031, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-032, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-033, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Daniels that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-035, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-034, Ms. Milam made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-037, Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.**

After a brief discussion, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to replace Don Henderson with James Artman and to replace Aaron Emerson with Brandon Witt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of a Board Member as Vice-Chairman for the Calendar Year 2023.**

After a brief discussion, Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve Lee Caesar, Jr. to continue as Vice-Chairman until possible reappointment. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**IX. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Board Members as Co-Chairs of the Board's Three Standing Committees for the Calendar Year 2023.**

After a brief discussion, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to appoint Michael Willard and Aaron Emerson as Co-Chairs of the Education, Experience & Testing Committee; Richard Broughton and Brandon Witt as Co-Chairs of the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee; and Danny Daniels and Davonna Milam as Co-Chairs of the Legislation & Rules Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**X. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Individuals to Education, Experience and Testing Committee; Legislation and Rules Committee; and Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee with Concurrent Appointment as Appraiser Hearing Officers for the Calendar Year 2023.**

After a brief discussion, Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the current committee rosters.

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Daniels	Yes
	Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**XIII. Presentation by Assistant Attorney General, Bryan Neal, and Possible Discussion as to the Oklahoma Open Meetings Act and Open Records Act.**

Tabled to January Board Meeting.

**IVX. NEW BUSINESS.** None.

**VX. ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

**OFFICIAL MINUTES.**

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through J.



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Lee R. Caesar, Jr.", written over a horizontal line.

**LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Jenelle LePoint", written over a horizontal line.

**JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD