



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

July 8, 2022
Date

357
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on July 8, 2022 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, July 6, 2022, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on June 30, 2022 and posted to the REAB website on July 6, 2022. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

| |
|----------------------|
| Lee R. Caesar, Jr. |
| Richard Broughton |
| Brandon J. Witt |
| Aaron S. Emerson |
| Michael S. Willard |
| Timothy R. Ledbetter |
| Patricia G. Broome |

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Dilan Lyda, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Jon Huntington, John Baca, John Dorna, Sara Clutts, AJ Ferate, Darla Riley and Stephen McCaleb.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the June 3, 2022, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BLAKE THOMAS; COMPLAINT #21-009; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Mr. Broughton and Mr. Emerson are recused as prior PCC members associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, this item was stricken from the agenda.

- IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF IVAN SMITH; COMPLAINT #21-021; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF LOUISE BREWER; COMPLAINT #21-007 AND COMPLAINT #21-007A; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Hearing Panel Recommendation listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A REQUEST BY THE BOARD'S PROSECUTOR TO CLOSE COMPLAINT #21-029, IN THE MATTER OF JOELLA JONES; WITH THE COMPLAINT TO BE PENDED TO JOELLA JONES' LICENSURE FILE; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Mr. Emerson is recused as prior PCC member associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to close Complaint #21-029 and pended the complaint to Joella Jones' licensure file as listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF PATRICK S. RYAN AND CHRIS M. WILLIAMS; COMPLAINT #20-016; TO INCLUDE AN APPLICATION FOR ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "E")

Ms. Broome and Mr. Broughton are recused as prior PCC members associated with review of this complaint.

Ms. Broome and Mr. Broughton exited the meeting.

Counsel for Respondents, Mr. Ferate, presented a preliminary Motion for En Banc Reconsideration of Hearing Examiner's Order Granting Motion to Strike and Brief in Support and an Offer of Proof. After presentation by Mr. Ferate and discussion by the board, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to deny Respondent's Motion for En Banc Reconsideration of Hearing Examiner's Order Granting Motion to Strike and Brief in Support. (Exhibit "F")

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Ferate again moved that he be allowed to enter an Offer of Proof for the record for a possible appeal. After discussion Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to deny the Offer of Proof and to deny submission of additional evidence at this stage.

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following oral argument by Mr. Ferate and Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

| | | |
|------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to adopt the Hearing Panel's Finding of Fact and Conclusions of Law and amend the recommended discipline by striking paragraph two of the Recommended Discipline listed in Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE

OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Ferate approached the Board and asked for a summarization of the action that was taken. Mr. Caesar summarized the action taken in Agenda Item VII.

Mr. Ferate presented a Motion for Immediate Stay of Enforcement and Brief in Support. After discussion Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to accept the Respondent's Motion for Immediate Stay of Enforcement and Brief in Support. (Exhibit "G")

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Caesar allowed a two-minute break.

Mr. Willard left the meeting.

Mr. Willard reentered the meeting.

Mr. Ferate approached the Board and asked for a clarification of his Motion for Immediate Stay of Enforcement and Brief in Support.

Ms. Broome and Mr. Broughton reentered the meeting.

VIII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No Report

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due April 30, 2022.** (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to administratively suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by August 31, 2022, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |

| | |
|-------------|-----|
| Ms. Broome | Yes |
| Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by August 31, 2022, and authority to issues certificates. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicant listed in Agenda Item VIII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (No Report)

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item IX. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "M")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to reinstate the license of the individual listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "N")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** No Report

D. **Probable Cause Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.** No Report

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee.** No report

3. **Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations.** (Exhibit "O")

Mr. Emerson is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IX. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-005, Mr. Broughton made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome that a Letter of Warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-006, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-007, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that a Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-008, Mr. Broughton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-009, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-010, Mr. Broughton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-011, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-012, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-013, Mr. Broughton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-014, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-015, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. Presentation by Assistant Attorney General, Bryan Neal and Possible Discussion as to the Oklahoma Open Meetings Act and Open Records Act

Tabled to August Board meeting.

XI. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Approval of Budget for Fiscal Year 2023.
(Exhibit "P")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the Budget for Fiscal Year 2023. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Caesar | Yes |
| | Mr. Witt | Yes |
| | Mr. Emerson | Yes |
| | Mr. Broughton | Yes |
| | Mr. Ledbetter | Yes |
| | Ms. Broome | Yes |
| | Mr. Willard | Yes |

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XII. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through P.





LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD