



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

April 1, 2022
Date

354
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on April 1, 2022 at 9:33 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, March 30, 2022, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on March 25, 2022 and posted to the REAB website on March 30, 2022. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar, Jr., called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

- Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
- Richard Broughton
- Brandon J. Witt
- Aaron S. Emerson
- Michael S. Willard
- Timothy R. Ledbetter
- Patricia G. Broome

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Kelli Price, Comm. Counsel; Christine McEntire, Director; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer and Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Stephen McCaleb and Rachel Lawrence Mor.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Emerson moved that the reading of the minutes of the March 4, 2022, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DEREK C. LAMKIN; COMPLAINT #21-002, TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

Agenda Item III was tabled to the May 2022 Board meeting.

- IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF AUBREY J. DOBBS; COMPLAINT #20-050, TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Broughton and Mr. Emerson are recused as prior PCC members associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the Hearing Panel Recommendation listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF AMY L. HENDREN; COMPLAINT #20-058; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Broughton and Mr. Emerson are recused as prior PCC members associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE MATTER OF DANIEL SIMON; COMPLAINT #20-048; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS AND A RECOMMENDATION OF RESOLUTION.**

Agenda Item VI was tabled to the May 2022 Board meeting.

VII. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** No report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. No report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due January 31, 2022.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve Board staff to administratively suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by May 31, 2022, and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff

to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies.** No Report.
- D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by May 31, 2022, and authority to issues certificates.** (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicant listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

- 1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the appointment of volunteers and/or committee members listed in Agenda Item VIII. A. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

- 1. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals.** (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote

with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given the authority to reinstate the license of the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")

(A) Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No Report

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No Report

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Emerson is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII D (3) in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #A21-053, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-054, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that a letter of warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-055, Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-056, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-057, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-058, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #21-059, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-001, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes

Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-002, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #22-003, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING EXERCISING THE THIRD OF THREE OPTIONS TO RENEW A CONTRACT WITH BETTY J. CAGLE AS APPRAISER-EXAMINER IN SUPPORT OF THE BOARD'S ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM FOR FY 2023 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS;** (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to renew the contract listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING EXERCISING THE THIRD OF THREE OPTIONS TO RENEW A CONTRACT WITH BIEN APPRAISAL, LLC AS APPRAISER-EXAMINER IN SUPPORT OF THE BOARD'S ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM FOR FY 2023 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS;** (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to renew the contract listed in Agenda Item X. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes

Mr. Willard	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONTRACT FOR LEGAL SERVICES FOR FISCAL YEAR 2023 WITH DERRYBERRY & NAIFEH WITH RESPECT TO PROSECUTORIAL SERVICES TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS; (Exhibit "O")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to approve the contract listed in Agenda Item XI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ATTENDANCE BY BOARD STAFF AT THE POLICY STATEMENT AND REGULATOR TRAINING (PSTAR) ON MAY 12, 2022, IN SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS; (Exhibit "P")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Agenda Item XII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Broughton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Mr. Willard	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

XIII. NEW BUSINESS. None.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.


OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through P.





LEE R. CAESAR, JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD