



STATE OF OKLAHOMA  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

December 4, 2020  
Date

340  
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on December 4th, 2020 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, December 2nd, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on November 30th, 2020 and posted to the REAB website on December 2nd, 2020. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. CALL TO ORDER. Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Stephen C. Walton;  
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.  
Brandon J. Witt;  
Aaron Emerson;  
Ryan C. Litz;  
Timothy R. Ledbetter  
Patty Broome

Board members excused were: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Kayla Rochelle, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Administrative Officer III and Jenelle LePoint, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steven McCaleb.

II. READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES. (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the November 6th, 2020 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Caesar Yes  
Mr. Witt Yes  
Mr. Emerson Yes  
Mr. Walton Yes  
Mr. Ledbetter Yes  
Ms. Broome Yes  
Mr. Litz Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BRYCE A. GADEN, COMPLAINT #19-028; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "C")

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the consent order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Caesar Yes  
Mr. Witt Yes  
Mr. Emerson Yes  
Mr. Walton Yes

Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**IV. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** No report.

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

**A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on September 30, 2020. (Exhibit "D")**

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve Board staff to suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by January 31, 2021 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "E")**

Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. No report.**

**D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by November 30, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")**

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to the companies listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**V. COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

**A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** No report.

**B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "G")**

**(A)** Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")**

**(A)** Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "I")**

**(A)** Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item V. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**C. Legislation & Rules Committee.** No report.

**D. Probable Cause Committee.**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.**

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to appoint Aaron Emerson as Chairman of the Probable Cause Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.**

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "J")**

Ms. Broome is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. in her capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-031, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-032, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-033, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes

Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-034, Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	
Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-035, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	
Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-036, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed following issuance of a non-disciplinary letter of concern. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	
Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-037, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	
Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-038, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was

seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-040, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-041, Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be dismissed following issuance of a non-disciplinary letter of concern. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF A BOARD MEMBER AS VICE-CHAIRMAN FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2021. No exhibit.

Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to appoint Lee Caesar, Jr. as Vice-Chairperson for the calendar year 2021. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF BOARD MEMBERS AS CO-CHAIRS OF THE BOARDS THREE STANDING COMMITTEES FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2021. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to replace Lee Caesar, Jr.

and Ryan Litz with Brandon Witt and Steve Walton regarding the Education, Experience and Testing Committee; to replace Brandon Witt with Ryan Litz regarding the Legislation & Rules Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**VIII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF INDIVIDUALS TO EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE; LEGISLATION AND RULES COMMITTEE; AND STANDARDS AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES COMMITTEE WITH CONCURRENT APPOINTMENT AS APPRAISER HEARING OFFICERS FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2021.** (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the new appointees listed in Agenda Item VIII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**IX. NEW BUSINESS.** No report.

**X. ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

**OFFICIAL MINUTES.**

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.



**STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

**ERIC M. SCHOEN, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD