



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

October 9, 2020
Date

338
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on October 9th, 2020 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, October 7th, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on October 2nd, 2020 and posted to the REAB website on October 7th, 2020. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Glen Mulready
Stephen C. Walton;
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.
Brandon J. Witt;
Aaron Emerson;
Ryan C. Litz;
Timothy R. Ledbetter;
Patty Broome

Board members excused were: None

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Kayla Rochelle, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Administrative Officer III and Jenelle LePoint, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steven McCaleb, Rachel Mor and Michael Dodson.

II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the September 11th, 2020 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BEVERLY A. BOWEN, COMPLAINT #19-037; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** No action.

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb and Rachel Mor; Agenda Item III. was tabled to the November Board meeting.

IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF JOHN H. JONES, COMPLAINT #19-036; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to accept the consent order presented in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF BRYCE A. GADEN, COMPLAINT #19-028; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** No action.

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb; Agenda Item V. was tabled to the November Board meeting.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF DAVID T. WATSON, COMPLAINT #19-040; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to accept the consent order presented in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF MICHAEL D. DODSON; COMPLAINT #19-012; TO INCLUDE A REQUEST FOR ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "E")

Following an oral argument by Rachel Mor and Steven McCaleb, Mr. Emerson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Commissioner Mulready left the meeting.

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
------------	------------	-----

Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to adopt the hearing panel recommendation striking items two, four and five listed in Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on July 31, 2020. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by November 30, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Litz made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. No report.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by November 30, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to the companies listed in Agenda Item VIII., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "I")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item IX. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes

Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Emerson to allow staff to be given authority to deny an original certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 2. (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IX. B. 3. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No report.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No report.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "L")

Ms. Broome is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IX. in her capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #A20-026, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes

Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-027, Mr. Litz made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that a non-disciplinary letter of concern be issued, the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-028, Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-030, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-029, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Emerson	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE APPRAISAL FOUNDATION AND APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION THAT APPROVED QUALIFYING EDUCATION COURSES BE ALLOWED TO CONVERT TO A SYNCHRONOUS PLATFORM DURING THE HEALTH EMERGENCY. No action.

After a brief discussion between the Board, Bryan Neal and Christine McEntire; Agenda Item X. was tabled to the November Board meeting.

XIII. NEW BUSINESS. No report.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.



Handwritten signature of Stephen C. Walton in black ink.

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

Handwritten signature of Eric M. Schoen in blue ink.

ERIC M. SCHOEN, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD