



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

May 1, 2020
Date

333
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a special session meeting on May 1st, 2020 at 9:36 a.m. The meeting was held by teleconference. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50th St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, April 29th, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on April 27th, 2020 and posted to the REAB website on April 29th, 2020. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

- Glen Mulready;
- Stephen C. Walton;
- Lee R. Caesar, Jr.;
- Brandon J. Witt;
- H.E. Ted Smith;
- Ryan C. Litz;
- Timothy R. Ledbetter;
- Patty Broome

Board members excused were: None

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Kayla Rochelle, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Administrative Officer III and Shannon Burns, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steven McCaleb and Teresa Green.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Smith moved that the reading of the minutes of the April 8th, 2020 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Caesar. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

- A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on February 28, 2020.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item III., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by June 30, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item III., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. No report.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by June 30, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the companies listed in Agenda Item III., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "F")

(A) Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item IV. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes

Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

(A) Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 3. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No report.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No report.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "I")

Ms. Broome is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IV. in her capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-049, Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes

Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-048, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-048B, Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-056, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-057, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-058, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-060, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-061, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-062, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be dismissed, file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-001, Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes

Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Recused
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A20-002, Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and a non-disciplinary letter of concern be issued. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-003, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #20-004, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Recused
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A WRITTEN REQUEST BY CERTIFIED RESIDENTIAL APPRAISER ROBERT GRAY FOR A WAIVER FROM THE REQUIREMENT TO TAKE 21 HOURS OF IN-PERSON CONTINUING EDUCATION DUE TO A CHRONIC MEDICAL CONCERN.** (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve the requested waiver listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes

Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. **NEW BUSINESS.** No report.

VII. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Commissioner Mulready to adjourn the Board meeting. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through J.



A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Stephen C. Walton".

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Eric M. Schoen".

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD