



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

December 6, 2019
Date

329
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on December 6th, 2019 at 9:32 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, December 4th, 2019 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on November 26th, 2019 and posted to the REAB website on December 4th, 2019. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Stephen C. Walton;
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.;
Brandon J. Witt;
H.E. Ted Smith;
Ryan C. Litz;
Timothy R. Ledbetter;
Patty Broome

Board members excused were: Glen Mulready

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Administrative Officer III and Kayla Dekat, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steven McCaleb, Rod Bien, Justin King and Vicki Walton.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the November 1st, 2019 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER.

- IX. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT AGREEMENT IN THE MATTER OF APPRAISAL LOGISTIC SOLUTIONS, INC.; COMPLAINT #A19-008; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IX. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to accept the consent agreement listed in Agenda IX. The Chair

ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION AS TO FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND RECOMMENDATION OF HEARING OFFICER IN THE MATTER OF COESTER VMS; COMPLAINT #A18-040 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item III. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

After a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to accept the recommendation listed in Agenda III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on September 30, 2019. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve Board staff to suspend each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by January 31, 2020 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies.** No report.
- D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by January 31, 2020 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "G")

Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the companies listed in Agenda Item IV., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** No report.

- B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals.** (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "I")

(A) Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes

Mr. Walton	Yes
Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to deny an original certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "J")

(A) Mr. Witt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 3. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No report.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No exhibit.

(A) Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to replace Mr. Smith with Ms. Broome as chair of the Probable Cause Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to replace Craig L. Wittmer with Kelly A. Davis on the Probable Cause Committee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-029, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-031, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-033, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be

taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-037, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-038, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-039, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Ledbetter that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-040, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes

Ms. Broome	Yes
Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-041, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-042, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-043, Mr. Ledbetter made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Witt that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF INDIVIDUALS TO EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE; LEGISLATION AND RULES COMMITTEE; AND STANDARDS AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES COMMITTEE WITH CONCURRENT APPOINTMENT AS APPRAISER HEARING OFFICERS FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2020.** (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Litz to approve the appointment of individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

Mr. Litz Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF BOARD MEMBERS AS CO-CHAIRS OF THE BOARDS THREE STANDING COMMITTEES FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2020. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve the re-appointment of individuals listed in Agenda Item VII for 2020. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF A BOARD MEMBER AS VICE-CHAIRMAN OF THE CALENDAR YEAR 2020. No exhibit.

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the re-appointment of Stephen Walton as vice-chairman of the Board. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Mr. Witt	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Mr. Ledbetter	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Mr. Litz	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. NEW BUSINESS. No report.

XI. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through M.



STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD