BEFORE THE REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD STATE OF OKLAHOMA

In the Matter of KRISTINA M. MATHIS	S)	Complaint #18-037
Respondent.	,)	90

CONSENT ORDER

COMES NOW the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board ("OREAB"), by and through the Prosecuting Attorney, Stephen McCaleb, and the Respondent KRISTINA M. MATHIS, and enter into this Consent Order pursuant to Oklahoma Statutes Title 59 §858-700, et seq. and Oklahoma Administrative Code 600:10-1-1, et seq. All sections of this order are incorporated together.

AGREED FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. In July of 2018, Respondent was hired by BOKF (the "client") to complete an appraisal (the "appraisal") for a property located at 2513 Kadlan Drive, El Reno, Oklahoma 73036 (the "subject"). Respondent completed and transmitted the appraisal with an effective date of July 27, 2018. The appraisal's intended use was for a Equity Take Out Transaction. Respondent derived an estimate of market value of \$185,000.
- 2. Respondent committed a series of errors in the report which led to a misleading, confusing, and non-credible report.
- 3. The initial appraisal completed by Respondent stated an opinion of value at

\$185,000.

- 4. The revised appraisal, with the same effective date as the first report, completed by Respondent for the same property stated an opinion of value at \$330,000.
- 5. There was no information discussed or analyzed in the revised report to disclose why the two reports differentiated in value, especially to the degree of the discrepancy.
- 6. Respondent adjusted the size at \$30.00 per square foot in the first appraisal and \$60.00 per square foot in the second appraisal without adequate explanation in the revised report. She also failed to disclose that comparable #3 was on a golf course, with a pool.

AGREED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(6) through 59 O.S. § 858-726, in that Respondent violated:
 - A) The Ethics, and Conduct Sections of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice Ethics Rule;
 - B) The Competency Rule of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice;
 - C) The Scope of Work Rule of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice;

- D) Standard 1, Standards Rules 1-1, 1-2, 1-4, and 1-6; Standard 2, Standards Rules 2-1, and 2-2 of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. These include the sub sections of the referenced rules; and
- 2. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(7): "Failure or refusal without good cause to exercise reasonable diligence in developing an appraisal, preparing an appraisal report or communicating an appraisal."
- 3. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(8): "Negligence or incompetence in developing an appraisal, in preparing an appraisal report, or in communicating an appraisal."
- 4. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(9): "Willfully disregarding or violating any of the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act."
- 5. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(13) in that Respondent violated 59 O.S. § 858-732(A)(1): "An appraiser must perform ethically and competently and not engage in conduct that is unlawful, unethical or improper. An appraiser who could reasonably be perceived to act as a disinterested third party in rendering an unbiased real property valuation must perform assignments with impartiality, objectivity and independence and without accommodation of personal interests."

6. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(6): "Violation of any of the standards for the development or communication of real estate appraisals as provided in the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act."

CONSENT AGREEMENT

The Respondent, by affixing her signature hereto, acknowledges:

- 1. That Respondent has been advised to seek the advice of counsel prior to signing this document.
 - 2. That Respondent possesses the following rights among others:
 - a. the right to a formal fact finding hearing before a disciplinary panel of the Board;
 - b. the right to a reasonable notice of said hearing;
 - c. the right to be represented by counsel;
 - d. the right to compel the testimony of witnesses;
 - e. the right to cross-examine witnesses against him; and
 - f. the right to obtain judicial review of the final decision of the Board.
- 3. The Respondent stipulates to the facts as set forth above and specifically waives her right to contest these findings in any subsequent proceedings before the Board and to appeal this matter to the District Court.
- 4. The Respondent consents to the entry of this Order affecting her professional practice of real estate appraising in the State of Oklahoma.

- 5. The Respondent agrees and consents that this Consent Order shall not be used by her for purposes of defending any other action initiated by the Board regardless of the date of the appraisal.
 - 6. All other original allegations in this matter are dismissed.
- 7. Respondent acknowledges this will be placed on the Board's agenda for its next monthly meeting after receipt of the executed Order from Respondent, and notice for the Order's placement on that agenda is accepted.¹
 - 8. All parties to this Consent Order have been represented by counsel.
- 9. This Consent Order may be executed in one or more counterparts, but all of such counterparts, taken together, shall constitute only one Consent Order. When delivered to the other party, facsimile and visual digital reproductions of original signatures shall be effective the same as if they were the originals.
- 10. This Consent Order shall be governed by the internal laws of the State of Oklahoma without regard to the conflict of law principles.
- 11. This Consent Order contains the entire agreement between the parties hereto and all provisions of this Consent Order are contractual and not a mere recital. The Parties acknowledge that no presentation or promise not expressly set forth in this Consent Order has been made by any of the Parties hereto or any of their agents, employees, representatives, or attorneys. No modification of, or amendment to, this

¹ Currently the next Board meeting is scheduled for 9:30 a.m. on September 6, 2019.

Consent Order shall be valid unless it is in writing and signed by the Parties. In the event any portion of this Consent Order shall be declared illegal or unenforceable as a matter of law, the remainder of the Consent Order shall remain in full force and effect.

- 12. This Consent Order is intended by the parties to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of their agreement. It supersedes any and all prior or contemporaneous agreements, understanding, discussions, negotiations, and commitments (written or oral). This Consent Order may not be altered, amended, modified, supplemented or otherwise changed except by a writing executed by an authorized representative of each of the parties.
- 13. The undersigned Respondent agrees that presentation of this Consent Order to the OREAB without the undersigned Respondent being present shall not constitute an improper, ex parte communication between the OREAB and its counsel.
- 14. The Parties represent and warrant to one another that each party has authority to enter into this binding Consent Order. The OREAB represents and warrants that the undersigned have full authority to execute this Consent Order on behalf of the OREAB and bind the OREAB to the terms set forth herein.
- 15. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile copies of this Consent Order, including PDF and facsimile signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.

16. The parties acknowledge that they understand the provisions of this Consent Order.

CONSENT ORDER TO BE ACCEPTED OR REJECTED BY THE BOARD

The Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board will not submit this Consent Order for the Board's consideration until its agreement and execution by the Respondent(s). It is hereby agreed between the parties that this Consent Order shall be presented to the Board with recommendation for approval of the Board at the next scheduled meeting of the Board. The Respondent understands that the Board is free to accept or reject this Consent Order and, if rejected by the Board, a formal hearing on the complaint may be held. If the Board does not accept the Consent Order, it shall be regarded as null and void. Admissions by Respondent in the rejected Consent Order will not be regarded as evidence against him at the subsequent disciplinary hearing. Respondent will be free to defend himself and no inferences will be made from his willingness to have entered this agreement. It is agreed that neither the presentation of the Consent Order nor the Board's consideration of the Consent Order will be deemed to have unfairly or illegally prejudiced the Board or its individual members and therefore will not be grounds for precluding the Board or any individual Board member from further participation in proceedings related to the matters set forth in the Consent Order.

• THIS <u>CONSENT ORDER</u> IS NOT EFFECTIVE UNTIL ITS APPROVAL BY A MAJORITY OF THE BOARD AND THE APPROVED ORDER RECEIVES A SUBSEQUENT ENDORSEMENT ("SIGNATURE") BY A REPRESENTATIVE OF THE BOARD. THE EXECUTED ORDER IS THEN SUBJECT TO A WRITTEN ANALYSIS BY THE OKLAHOMA ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE.

ORDER

WHEREFORE, on the basis of the foregoing Agreed Findings of Fact and Agreed Conclusions of Law, it is ordered and that:

- 1. Respondent agrees that she will successfully complete, pass the test, and provide proof of completion and passing of the tests to the Board's office for the following corrective education courses within sixty (60) days from the date the Consent Order is approved by the Oklahoma Attorney General. Should the courses not be offered within the first sixty days (60), the Respondent shall request and seek approval for good cause from the Board for an extension of time to complete the course work (this will take formal Board action). The courses to be taken are:
 - a) Course #60C or 602: Basic Appraisal Procedures (no CE credit given);

- b) Course #60G or 614: Residential Report Writing and Case Studies;
- c) Course #60F or 613: Residential Sales Comparison & Income Approach; and
- d) Course 908: That's A Violation.²
- 2. Respondent shall pay an administrative fine of \$750, to be paid within thirty (30) days of the Final Order, pursuant to 59 O.S. §858-723.
- 3. If any of the penalties are not completed timely, Respondent agrees that her license shall be suspended until such time compliance occurs.

DISCLOSURE

Pursuant to the Oklahoma Open Records Act, 51 O.S. §§24-A.1 – 24A.21, the signed original of this Consent Order shall remain in the custody of the Board as a public record and shall be made available for public inspection and copying upon request.

RESPONDENT:

KRISTINA M. MATHIS

ATE

² It is of note that Respondent proactively sought out corrective education prior to this agreement.

CERTIFICATE OF BOARD PROSECUTING ATTORNEY

I believe this Consent Order to be in the best interests of the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board, the State of Oklahoma and the Respondent with regard to the violations alleged in the formal Complaint.

STEPHEN MCCALEB, OBA #15649

Board Prosecutor

3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100

Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73112

DATE

IT IS SO ORDERED on this

ERIC SCHOEN, Board Secretary

Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board

OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

By:

BRYAN NEAL, OBA #6590

Assistant Attorney General Attorney for the Board 313 NE 21st Street

Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73105

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I, Kayla Dekat, hereby certify that on the 10 day of September, 2019 a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing Consent Order was placed in the U.S. Mail, with postage prepaid, by certified mail, return receipt requested to:

Kristina M. Mathis 9009 SW 46th St. Oklahoma City, OK 73179 9214 8902 0982 7500 0237 17

and by First Class Mail to:

Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL 313 N.E. 21st Street Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Stephen L. McCaleb DERRYBERRY & NAIFEH 4800 N. Lincoln Boulevard Oklahoma City, OK 73105

KAYLADEKAT