



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

May 1, 2019
Date

322
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on May 1st, 2019 at 9:44 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, April 29th, 2019 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on April 24th, 2019 and posted to the REAB website on April 29th, 2019. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:44 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Stephen C. Walton;
Lee R. Caesar, Jr.;
Betty J. Cagle;
H.E. Ted Smith;
Patty Broome

Board members excused were: Glen Mulready, Becky Zarecki and Layperson (vacant).

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Christine McEntire, Director; Barron Brown, OIG Counsel; Eric Schoen, Administrative Officer III; and Kayla Dekat, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steven McCaleb, Rachel Mor, Justin King, James Singley, Wilma Watson and Alice Moeller.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the April 5th, 2019 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER.

- VI. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

- A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on February 28, 2019.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, NONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by June 30, 2019 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. No report.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by June 30, 2019 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item VI., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "F")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VII. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII. B. 3. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Vice-Chair ordered a five minute recess.

Commissioner Glen Mulready entered the meeting.

III. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF WILMA S. WATSON; COMPLAINT #17-043; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item III. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief presentation from Steven McCaleb and Justin King, Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
-----------------	------------	-----

Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Recused
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Excused

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Becky Zarecki entered the meeting.

The Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes
	Commissioner Mulready	Yes

Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to accept the consent order listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Commissioner Glen Mulready exited the meeting.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF JAMES SINGLEY; COMPLAINT #18-010; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IV. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following James Singley's oral argument and a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes
	Commissioner Mulready	Excused

Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to modify the consent order

listed in Agenda Item III with the following changes: Regarding the disciplinary recommendation, item number one will be removed and replaced with taking the tested courses "Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use", "15 Hour National USPAP" and "Residential Report Writing and Case Studies" to be taken within 90 days from the date of the order. Items number two and number three are accepted as presented. Regarding item number four, the respondent will be placed on probation for twelve months beginning immediately following the completion of the three courses. The respondent will also provide a work log to the Board office on the 5th working day of each month. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING RESOLUTION OF THE MATTER OF MICHAEL A. MASSEY AND MICHAEL T. ORMAN; COMPLAINT #18-006; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief presentation by Steven McCaleb, Rachel Mor and Justin King, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki to approve the letter of concern listed in Agenda Item V. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** No report.

D. **Probable Cause Committee.**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.** No report.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee.** No report.

3. **Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations.** (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-034, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-001, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A19-003, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-005, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-006, Mr. Caesar made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A19-008, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes

Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-009, Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-010, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #19-011, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Yes
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. **NEW BUSINESS.** No report.

IX. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.





STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD