



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

November 5, 2014
Date

268
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular meeting on November 5, 2014 at 9:30 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, November 3, 2014 at 9:00 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on October 29, 2014 and posted to the REAB website on November 3, 2014. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Vice-Chairperson Lee R. Caesar Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Lee R. Caesar Jr.;
James R. Artman;
Betty J. Cagle;
P. Lane Wheeler
Stephen C. Walton;
Shelley Pruitt;
John P. Smithson

Board members excused were: John D. Doak

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Susan Dobbins, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary and Ashley Snider, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Jenny Smithson, Brent Robinson, Ron Flowers, Joe Garnand, Daniel Gamino and Tyler Laughlin.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Wheeler moved that the reading of the minutes of the October 1, 2014 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Walton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Commissioner John D. Doak entered the meeting.

III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION AS TO COMPLAINT # 13-019; IN THE MATTER OF WILLIAM D. MOWAT; TO INCLUDE AN APPLICATION FOR ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS**

After a brief discussion by Steve McCaleb and Daniel Gamino, this agenda item was tabled until the December 3, 2014 regular session meeting.

IV. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION AS TO COMPLAINT # 13-026; IN THE MATTER OF WILLIAM D. MOWAT; TO INCLUDE AN APPLICATION FOR ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.**

After a brief discussion by Steve McCaleb and Daniel Gamino, this agenda item was tabled until the December 3, 2014 regular session meeting.

V. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on August 31, 2014. (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue an order to suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by December 31, 2014 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for Appraisal Management Companies. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to approve Board staff to issue original certificates of registration to the companies listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by December 31, 2014 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue renewal certificates to the company listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV B. 2 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes

Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to allow staff to be given authority to issue the applicants trainee appraiser credentials to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV B. 2 (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to allow staff to be given authority to reinstate the credential of the individual listed in Agenda Item IV B. 2 (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to allow staff to be given authority to issue upgrade certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation and Rules Committee. (Exhibit "J")

Brett Robinson outlined the results of the November 4th election results and offered a brief presentation as to the 2015 Legislative Session.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No action.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No action.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. D. 3 in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #14-022, Mr. Wheeler made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that this matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Recused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE; NONE OPPOSED AND TWO RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- VII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF INDIVIDUALS TO EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE; LEGISLATION AND RULES COMMITTEE; AND INDIVIDUALS TO STANDARDS AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES COMMITTEE WITH CONCURRENT APPOINTMENT AS APPRAISER HEARING OFFICERS FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2015 No action taken. (Exhibit "L")
- VIII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING PROPOSED ATTENDANCE AT THE PUBLIC MEETING OF THE APPRAISAL PRACTICES BOARD SCHEDULED FOR NOVEMBER 14, 2014 IN KANSAS CITY, MISSOURI BY BOARD MEMBER SHELLEY PRUITT. No action taken. (Exhibit "M").
- IX. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION AS TO THE REPORT BY BOARD MEMBERS AND BOARD STAFF REGARDING THEIR ATTENDANCE AT THE PUBLIC MEETING OF THE APPRAISAL STANDARDS BOARD AND THE FALL CONFERENCE OF THE ASSOCIATION OF APPRAISER REGULATOR OFFICIALS BETWEEN OCTOBER 17, 2014 AND OCTOBER 20, 2014 IN WASHINGTON, D.C. No action.
- X. NEW BUSINESS. No Action.
- XI. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted herein and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through K.



LEE R. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD