

STATE OF OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

May 2, 2018 Date

310

Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on May 2nd, 2018 at 9:35 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, April 30, 2018 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on April 25, 2018 and posted to the REAB website on April 30, 2018. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. <u>CALL TO ORDER.</u> Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

Stephen C. Walton;

Betty J. Cagle; H.E. Ted Smith; Becky Zarecki; Shelley Pruitt; Patty Broome

Board members excused were: John D. Doak & James R. Artman

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Brett Robinson, Ron Flowers, Crystal Flowers, Josh Woodson, and Rod Bien.

II. READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES. (Exhibit "B")

Ms. Cagle moved that the reading of the minutes of the April 4, 2018 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER IN THE MATTER OF SERVICE 1ST VALUATION AND SETTLEMENT SERVICES; COMPLAINT #A17-014; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "C)

Following a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Smith moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer listed in Agenda Item III. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Cagle. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, NONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF ANNEMIEKE E. ROELL; COMPLAINT #17-020 AND COMPLAINT #17-025; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

Following a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Ms. Zarecki moved to accept the recommendation of the hearing panel listed in Agenda Item IV. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Excuse
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, NONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. <u>DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF VINCENT P. ADAMS; COMPLAINT #17-018A; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.</u> (Exhibit "E")

Following a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved to accept the recommendation of the hearing panel listed in Agenda Item V. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Excused
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, NONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A RECOMMENDATION OF DISMISSAL BY THE BOARD'S PROSECUTOR IN THE MATTER OF NOVO APPRAISAL MANAGEMENT COMPANY; COMPLAINT #A15-027 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. No exhibit.

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Ms. Zarecki made a Motion to nominate Ms. Cagle as temporary vice-chairman. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Broome. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Recused
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes

Ms. Zarecki

Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Mr. Smith moved to accept the recommendation of the Board's Prosecutor listed in Agenda Item VI. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Recused
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on February 28, 2018. (Exhibit "F")

Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to approve Board staff to suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item VII., Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, NONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by June 30, 2018 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. No report.
- D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by June 30, 2018 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit

"H")

Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item VII., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.
- B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "I")
- (A) Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")
- (A) Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original trainee certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Ms. Cagle Excused Yes

Mr. Smith Mr. Walton

Yes Yes

Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")
- (A) Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Broome to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Excused
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- D. Probable Cause Committee.
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No report.
- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.
- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "L")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-001, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Excused
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Recused
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-003, regarding CRA1, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. Regarding CRA2 and under the same Motion, the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Excused
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Recused
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-004, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that a non-disciplinary letter of warning be issued, the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Recused
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Brett Robinson entered the meeting.

Following discussion of Grievance #A18-005, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Recused
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-006, Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Recused
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-008, Ms. Broome made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the grievance be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Recused
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #18-010, Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded

by Ms. Broome that the grievance be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Recused
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

C. Legislation & Rules Committee.

Brett Robinson gave a presentation regarding the 2018 legislative session.

IX. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF DAVID R. ENGLE TO THE EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE FOR THE REMAINDER OF CALENDAR YEAR 2018. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to accept the appointment of David R. Engle to the EET Committee listed in Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Excused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Ms. Broome Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

X. NEW BUSINESS.

XI. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through M.

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY

OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD