



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

March 7, 2018
Date

308
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on March 7, 2018 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, March 5, 2018 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on February 28, 2018 and posted to the REAB website on March 5, 2018. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: John D. Doak;
Stephen C. Walton;
James R. Artman;
Betty J. Cagle;
H.E. Ted Smith;
Becky Zarecki;
Shelley Pruitt

Board members excused were: Patty Broome

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary and Sherry Ainsworth, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Dan Gamino, Matthew Bales, Garrett Pearce, Denise Lawson and Kevin Gant.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Artman moved that the reading of the minutes of the February 7, 2018 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Zarecki. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF MATTHEW A. BALES AND GARETT S. PEARCE; COMPLAINT #17-009 A, B AND C AND COMPLAINT #17-010 A, B AND C; TO INCLUDE A REQUEST FOR ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Artman is recused from consideration of Agenda Item III. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following oral argument by Daniel Gamino and Matthew Bales in addition to a presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved to go into executive session. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Zarecki. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes
	Commissioner Doak	Yes

Ms. Cagle moved to accept the disciplinary hearing panel recommendation listed in Agenda Item III. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After a request to stay the recommendation of the disciplinary hearing panel for 30 days by Daniel Gamino, Mr. Smith moved to accept the request from Mr. Gamino. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Zarecki. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT ORDER IN THE MATTER OF REAL SHIELD, LLC; COMPLAINT #A17-017; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Artman is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IV. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved to accept the consent order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Excused
-----------------	------------	---------

Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Excused
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on December 31, 2017.** No report.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by April 30, 2018 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V., Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies.** No report.

D. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by April 30, 2018 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item V., Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. **COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

A. **Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** No report.

B. **Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals.** (Exhibit "G")

(A) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")

(A) Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original trainee certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "I")

(A) Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No report.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.** No report.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee.** No report.

3. **Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations.** (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Smith is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-040, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-043, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-046, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A17-047, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that a Letter of Warning be issued, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes

Mr. Smith	Recused
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Ms. Broome	Excused
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-048, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A17-049, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the matter be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-050, Ms. Zarecki made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-051, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the matter be adopted as a complaint and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #17-052, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman that the matter be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Recused
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Ms. Broome	Excused
	Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ATTENDANCE BY BOARD MEMBERS AND BOARD STAFF AT THE SPRING CONFERENCE OF THE ASSOCIATION OF APPRAISER REGULATORY OFFICIALS IN SEATTLE, WASHINGTON BETWEEN MAY 4 AND MAY 6, 2018.** (Exhibit "K") No action.

VIII. **NEW BUSINESS.**

IX. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through K.



A blue ink signature of Stephen C. Walton, written in a cursive style.

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A blue ink signature of Eric M. Schoen, written in a cursive style.

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD