# BEFORE THE REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD STATE OF OKLAHOMA

| In the Matter of SAMUEL R. FANNIN, | ) |                   |
|------------------------------------|---|-------------------|
|                                    | ) | Complaint #15-051 |
| Respondent.                        | ) |                   |

#### CONSENT ORDER FOR RESPONDENT SAMUEL R. FANNIN

COMES NOW the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board ("OREAB"), by and through the Prosecuting Attorney, Stephen McCaleb, and the Respondent SAMUEL R. FANNIN, by and through his attorney of record, Rachel Lawrence Mor, and enter into this Consent Order pursuant to Oklahoma Statutes Title 59 §858-700, et seq. and Oklahoma Administrative Code 600:10-1-1, et seq. All sections of this order are incorporated together.

### AGREED FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Respondent is a reciprocal Certified Residential Appraiser ("CRA") who resides in Texas.
- 2. Respondent was hired to complete an appraisal (the "appraisal") for a property located at 146 Chinook Road, Broken Bow, Oklahoma (the "subject"). Respondent listed BOKF, NA dba Bank of Oklahoma as the lender/client.
- 3. The first report was transmitted to the client, on September 21, 2015. The client asked for revisions and the second and final appraisal was transmitted to the client on September 30, 2015.

- 4. The complaint was filed after the first appraisal and before the second and final appraisal was sent to the client.
  - 5. The appraisal's intended use was for a purchase transaction.
- 6. The Board alleges that the Respondent committed several errors in the appraisal report which resulted in a misleading or non-credible report.
- 7. Respondent does not agree that the appraisal was misleading or non-credible, but he does agree to compromise and settle the matter pursuant to this Consent Order.
- 8. The comparables selected by Respondent were more than 50 miles away from the subject in Broken Bow and were actually located in western Bowie County, Texas.
- 9. From a locational standpoint, this is an obviously difficult appraisal. While it is hard to locate comparables in the area, there are differences between McCurtain County with a 33,000 population and Bowie County, Texas with a population of 93,000. However, the area of western Bowie County is similar to McCurtain County. The median income is approximately \$10,000 more per person in Bowie County, Texas.
- 10. Respondent did not locate similar comparables in the State of Oklahoma that would have been considered good comparables for the subject.

11. Many of Respondent's comments were canned comments and offer nothing towards describing this specific property.

#### AGREED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(6) through 59 O.S. §858-726, in that Respondent violated: Standards Rule 1-1, 1-2 and 2-1, 2-2 of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 2. That Respondent violated 59 O.S. § 858-723 C (8): which involves negligence in developing, preparing or communicating an appraisal.
- 3. That Respondent has violated 59 O.S. § 858-723(C)(6): which involves the violation of any of the standards for the development or communication of real estate appraisals as provided in the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act.

## **CONSENT AGREEMENT**

The Respondent, by affixing his signature hereto, acknowledges:

- That Respondent has been advised to seek the advice of counsel prior to signing this document, and
- 2. That Respondent possesses the following rights among others:
  - a. the right to a formal fact finding hearing before a disciplinary panel of the Board;
  - b. the right to a reasonable notice of said hearing;

- c. the right to be represented by counsel;
- d. the right to compel the testimony of witnesses;
- e. the right to cross-examine witnesses against him; and
- f. the right to obtain judicial review of the final decision of the Board.
- 3. The Respondent waives his right to contest these findings in any subsequent proceedings before the Board and to appeal this matter to the District Court.
- 4. The Respondent consents to the entry of this Consent Order affecting his professional practice of real estate appraising in the State of Oklahoma.
- 5. The Respondent agrees and consents that this Consent Order shall not be used by him for purposes of defending any other action initiated by the Board regardless of the date of the appraisal.
  - 6. All other original allegations in this matter are dismissed.

### <u>ORDER</u>

WHEREFORE, on the basis of the foregoing Agreed Findings of Fact and Agreed Conclusions of Law, it is ordered and that:

- 1. The Respondent shall complete the following courses, which can be taken in person or on-line:
  - A) A 15 hour USPAP course which must be completed and tested;

- B) FHA/SFR Appraising Handbook 4000.1, No. 154, Columbia Institute 7 hours.
- C) Course #622 Advanced Residential Case Studies which must be tested.

The Respondent has one year from the final approval and filing of this consent order to complete the courses.

#### **DISCLOSURE**

Pursuant to the Oklahoma Open Records Act, 51 O.S. §§24-A.1 – 24A.21, the signed original of this Consent Order shall remain in the custody of the Board as a public record and shall be made available for public inspection and copying upon request.

#### **FUTURE VIOLATIONS**

In the event the Respondent fails to comply with any of the terms and conditions of this Consent Order, Respondent will be ordered to show cause for his failure to comply which could result in additional penalties.

RESPONDENT:

SAMUEL R. FANNIN

12-21-2016

DATE

BACHEL LAWRENCE MOR. OBA# 11400

#### CERTIFICATE OF BOARD PROSECUTING ATTORNEY

I believe this Consent Order to be in the best interests of the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board, the State of Oklahoma and the Respondent with regard to the violations alleged in the formal Complaint.

STEPHEN MCCALEB, OBA #15649 Board Prosecutor 3625 NW 56<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 100 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73112

DATE

IT IS SO ORDERED on this 5th day of October, 2017.

OE COMMON ONER

**ERIC SCHOEN**, Board Secretary Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board

OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

By:

BKYAN NEAL, OBA #6590 Assistant Attorney General Attorney for the Board 313 NE 21<sup>st</sup> Street Oklahoma City, Oklahoma

73105

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MAILING**

I, Sherry Ainsworth, hereby certify that on the day of March, 2017 a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing Order was placed in the U.S. Mail, with postage pre-paid, by certified mail, return receipt requested to:

7015 1520 0003 4174 4820

Jennet

Rachel Lawrence Mor 3037 N.W. 63rd Street, Suite 205 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73116 Attorney for Respondent Samuel R. Fannin

and that copies were forwarded by first class mail to the following:

Scott C. Goforth, Hearing Panel Officer 3705 W Memorial Rd, Ste 306 Oklahoma City, OK 73134

Robert Kerbo, Hearing Panel Officer 12325 S. Longhorn Circle Glenpool, OK 74033

Brandon T. Lux, Hearing Panel Officer 6525 N Meridian Ave, Ste 309 Oklahoma City, OK 73116 Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL 313 N.E. 21<sup>st</sup> Street Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Stephen L. McCaleb DERRYBERRY & NAIFEH 4800 N. Lincoln Boulevard Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Sherry Ainsworth



#### RECEIVED OKLAHOMA INSURANCE DEPT.

MAR 1 4 2017

## OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL STATE OF OKLAHOMA

Real Estate Appraiser Board

## ATTORNEY GENERAL OPINION 2017-167A

Christine McEntire, Director Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board 3625 N.W. 56th St., Ste. 100 Oklahoma City, OK 73112

March 9, 2017

#### Dear Director McEntire:

This office has received your request for a written Attorney General Opinion regarding agency action that the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board intends to take pursuant to a consent agreement with licensee 12649CRA. The proposed action is to require the licensee to complete a fifteen-hour course on the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice, a seven-hour course on FHA/SFR real estate appraiser standards, and a course in advanced residential case studies.

The licensee holds a reciprocal license in Oklahoma and produced an appraisal report as part of a refinance transaction, which included inappropriate comparables. Comparables are properties with similar characteristics to the subject property. Specifically, the appraisal was for a manufactured home in Broken Bow, Oklahoma, but comparables were utilized from Bowie County, Texas, which resulted in distinct differences in population and median income. The report contained "canned comments," which did not describe the particular property, and contained conflicting legal descriptions.

The Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, 59 O.S.2011 & Supp.2016, §§ 858-700-858-732, authorizes the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board to discipline licensees based on "[v]iolation of any of the standards for the development or communication of real estate appraisals," and based on "[n]egligence or incompetence," 59 O.S.Supp.2016, § 858-723(C)(6), (8). The Act requires adherence to the "current edition of" the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice ("USPAP"), 59 O.S.2011, § 858-726, which is the 2016-2017 edition.

The USPAP contains professional requirements pertaining to ethics, competency, and scope of work. See ETHICS RULE, USPAP-8 (requiring compliance with USPAP standards); COMPETENCY RULE, USPAP-12 (requiring appraisers to be competent to perform assignment or acquire necessary competency); SCOPE OF WORK RULE, USPAP-14 (requiring appraiser to perform scope of work necessary to develop credible results and disclose such information in the appraisal report). USPAP also contains standards such as Standard 1, which requires the appraiser to "complete research and analyses necessary to produce a credible appraisal." USPAP-17. Components of Standard 1 clarify that this means the appraiser must employ proper valuation techniques and identify relevant characteristics of the property. USPAP-17, 18. Further, Standard 2 requires that appraisal reports communicate all analyses, opinions, and conclusions clearly and 313 N.E. 21ST STREET • OKLAHOMA CITY, OK 73105 • (405) 521-3921 • FAX: (405) 521-6246

accurately. USPAP-22. The action seeks to enforce requirements of professionalism embodied in the Act and in the USPAP. The Board may reasonably believe that the disciplinary action is necessary to prevent future violations.

It is, therefore, the official opinion of the Attorney General that the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board has adequate support for the conclusion that this action advances the State of Oklahoma's policy to uphold standards of competency and professionalism among real estate appraisers.

MIKE HUNTER

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA

Malettente