

#### STATE OF OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

#### **OFFICIAL MINUTES**

February 12, 2014

258 Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a special meeting on February 12, 2014 at 9:30 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, February 10, 2014 at 9:00 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on February 10, 2014 and posted to the REAB website on February 10, 2014. The agenda is attached as Exhibit A.

I. CALL TO ORDER. Vice-Chairperson Lee R. Caesar, Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

John D. Doak, Chairperson

Lee R. Caesar, Jr.; James R. Artman; Betty J. Cagle; P. Lane Wheeler; Stephen C. Walton; and

Shelley Pruitt

Board members excused were:

John P. Smithson

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General, Barron Brown, Counsel for Commissioner John D. Doak, Eric Schoen, Board Secretary, and Rebecca Keesee, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Brett Robinson, Joe Garnand, Richie Howells, Glinda Cordell and Mike Cordell.

II. READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES. (Exhibit B) Mr. Wheeler moved that the reading of the minutes of the January 8, 2013 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Walton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. Tabled from December 4, 2013 and January 8, 2014 Regular Session:

<u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Agreement as to Complaint</u>

#A13-001; Against ACT Appraisal, Inc., d/b/a Accurate, Concise & Timely Appraisals;
to Include any Associated Matters or Motions (Exhibit C)

Mr. Caesar recused himself from consideration of Agenda Item III due to Probable Cause Committee service.

Upon recusal of Mr. Caesar, Mr. Wheeler moved that Mr. Walton be nominated as interim Vice-Chairperson. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Recused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After a brief oral presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Wheeler made a Motion to approve the Consent Order as presented. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Recused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Agreement as to Complaint</u>
#13-007; In the Matter of K. Jill Dickson, to Include any Associated Matters or Motions.
(Exhibit D)

Mr. Caesar recused himself from consideration of Agenda Item III due to Probable Cause Committee service.

After a brief oral presentation by Mr. McCaleb, Mr. Wheeler made a Motion to approve the Consent Order as presented. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Recused

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

## DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on November 30, 2013. (Exhibit E)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue an order to suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes

Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by March 31, 2014 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit F)

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for Appraisal Management Companies. No action taken.
- D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by March 31, 2014 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit G)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

### VI. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.
- B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit H)

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Cagle to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes

Mr. Smithson Excused Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of various applications received and authority to issue certificates.(Exhibit I)
- (A) Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given authority to issue reciprocal licenses to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman

Yes

Ms. Cagle

Yes

Mr. Wheeler

Yes

Mr. Walton

Yes

Ms. Pruitt

Yes

Mr. Smithson

Excused

Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit J)
- (A) Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to allow the staff to be given authority to approve the application for upgrade and be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3 (A), contingent upon receipt of proof of acceptable examination results and payment of the required fee. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation and Rules Committee. (Exhibit K)

Legislative Liaison Brett Robinson presented an oral report regarding pending legislation of interest to the Board.

- D. Probable Cause Committee.
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No Action.
- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No action.
- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit L)

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-023, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. Ms. Pruitt seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes

Mr. Wheeler
Mr. Walton
Ms. Pruitt
Mr. Smithson
Mr. Caesar

Yes
Yes
Yes
Mrecused
Yes
Excused
Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-024, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that a non-disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued to the Respondent, and further, an official Letter of Warning be issued to the third-party appraiser regarding violation of USPAP's ethic's rule. Thereafter, the file should be closed and no further action be taken Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman

Yes

Ms. Cagle

Yes

Mr. Wheeler

Yes

Mr. Walton

Recused

Mr. Walton Recused Ms. Pruitt Yes Mr. Smithson Excused Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-025, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Recused
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-026, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Recused
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Excused
Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-027, a Motion was made by Ms. Pruitt that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Mr. Artman seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Artman Yes

Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Wheeler Yes
Mr. Walton Recused

Ms. Pruitt Mr. Smithson Yes Excused

Mr. Caesar

Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Implementation of the Mandatory Supervisor-Trainee Course Pursuant to the January 1, 2015 Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria.</u> (Exhibit M) No action taken.

VIII. <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>.

IX. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

# OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted herein and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through M.

LEE R. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY

OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD