

STATE OF OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

February 1, 2017

295 Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on February 1, 2017 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, January 30, 2017 at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on January 25, 2017 and posted to the REAB website on January 30, 2017. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. <u>CALL TO ORDER.</u> Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

John D. Doak;

Stephen C. Walton; James R. Artman; Betty J. Cagle; H.E. Ted Smith; Becky Zarecki; Shelley Pruitt;

John Smithson

Board members excused were:

None

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary and Sherry Ainsworth, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Brett Robinson and Taylor McGarry.

II. READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES. (Exhibit "B")

Ms. Cagle moved that the reading of the minutes of the January 4, 2017 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of an individual for non-payment of annual fees due on November 30, 2016. (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to suspend the individuals listed in Agenda Item III, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by March 31, 2017 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item III, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit "D").

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to issue original certificates of registration to the companies listed in Agenda Item III, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by March 31, 2017 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item III, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VO	TC	E:
--------------	----	----

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes

Ms. Zarecki

Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.
- B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item IV. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")
- (A) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 2. (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue trainee certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman	Yes
Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to reinstate the certified residential appraiser credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 2 (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "H")
- (A) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki to allow staff to be given authority to issue upgrade certificates for the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV. B. 3 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- D. Probable Cause Committee.
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No report.
- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No report.
- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Artman is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IV. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-033, Mr. Smith made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that this matter, upon submission of the course completion certificate to board staff, be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-034, Ms. Cagle made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Zarecki that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Ms. Cagle Mr. Smith Mr. Walton Recused Yes

Yes Yes Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #A16-035, Ms. Cagle made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that the original grievance against the AMC be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken and that a complaint be adopted against the appraiser identified as "CRA2" and forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-037, Ms. Pruitt made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-040, Ms. Cagle made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Sith that a non-disciplinary letter of concern be issued, the matter be dismissed, file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-041, Ms. Cagle made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-042, Ms. Cagle made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-044, Mr. Smith made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Recused
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE CHANGES TO THE UNIFORM SCHEDULE OF SUGGESTED PENALTIES FOR VIOLATIONS OF THE OKALAHOMA CERTIFIED REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS ACT AND PROMULGATED RULES TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "J")

Ms. Zarecki moved to accept the administrative changes listed in Agenda Item V. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman Yes
Ms. Cagle Yes
Mr. Smith Yes
Mr. Walton Yes
Ms. Pruitt Yes
Mr. Smithson Yes
Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ATTENDANCE BY BOARD MEMBERS AND BOARD STAFF AT THE SPRING CONFERENCE OF THE ASSOCIATION OF APPRAISER REGULATORY OFFICIALS IN TAMPA, FLORIDA BETWEEN APRIL 7, 2017 AND APRIL 9, 2017. No action. (Exhibit "K")

VII. <u>DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ATTENDANCE BY BOARD STAFF</u>
<u>AT INVESTIGATOR TRAINING IN 2017 AS SPONSORED BY THE APPRAISAL</u>
<u>FOUNDATION</u>. (Exhibit "L")

Ms. Cagle moved to accept the requested attendance by board staff listed in Agenda Item VII. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Artman. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Artman

Yes

Ms. Cagle

Yes

Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Ms. Zarecki	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT AGREEMENT IN THE MATTER OF GARY L. WARD, COMPLAINT #16-019; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Artman is recused from consideration of Agenda Item III. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief discussion by Steve McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved to accept the Consent Agreement as listed in Agenda Item VIII. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr Smithson	Yes

Ms. Zarecki Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

IV. Legislation & Rules Committee.

Brett Robinson offered a brief presentation as to the 2017 Legislative Session which begins Monday, February 6th, 2017.

IX. <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>.

X. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through M.

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD