



STATE OF OKLAHOMA  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

January 6, 2016  
Date

282  
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on January 6, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, January 4, 2016 at 9:00 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on December 29, 2015 and posted to the REAB website on January 4, 2016. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Lee R. Caesar Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:           John D. Doak;  
  Lee R. Caesar Jr.  
  James R. Artman;  
  H.E. Ted Smith  
  Stephen C. Walton;  
  John Smithson

Board members excused were:       Betty J. Cagle and Shelley Pruitt

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary and Sherry Ainsworth, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Ron Flowers, Mike Cordell, Tom Gruber, Tyler Laughlin, Kalen Caesar, and Jim Marshall.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Walton moved that the reading of the minutes of the December 2, 2015 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smithson. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Abstained

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE ABSTAINED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A MOTION FOR REHEARING, REOPENING OR RECONSIDERATION IN THE MATTER OF BEN B. BOOTHE AND RICHARD J. TIBBENHAM; COMPLAINT #14-024 TO INCLUDE ORAL ARGUMENT AND ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

Upon oral argument presented by Tom Gruber on behalf of the respondents and Stephen McCaleb on behalf of the Real Estate Appraiser Board, Mr. Caesar moved to go into executive session. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Doak	Yes

Mr. Artman moved that the Board grant the request for a Motion for Rehearing, Reopening or Reconsideration in the matter of Ben B. Boothe and Richard J. Tibbenham. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	No

THE RESULT WAS THREE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND ONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on October 31, 2015.** No report.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by February 29, 2016 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to approve Board staff to issue certificates of registration to the companies listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by February 29, 2016 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")**

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**V. COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

**A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** No report.

**B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "G")**

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")**

**(A)** Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smithson to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
-----------------	------------	-----

Ms. Cagle	Excused
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Excused
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to allow staff to be given authority to issue trainee appraiser credentials to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2 (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to reinstate the certified general appraiser credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2 (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "I")**

Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to allow staff to be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 3. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** No report.

D. **Probable Cause Committee.** No report.

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.** No action.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee.** No action.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. No action.

VI. **PUBLIC HEARING REGARDING PROPOSED PERMANENT RULEMAKING AT 10-1-5 QUALIFYING EDUCATION PREREQUISITE AND 10-1-6 SUPERVISION OF TRAINEE APPRAISERS A POSTED IN THE NOVEMBER 5, 2015 NOTICE OF PROPOSED PERMANENT RULEMAKING FILED WITH THE OKLAHOMA SECRETARY OF STATE. (Exhibit "J")**

As no one appeared to present oral comment as to the Board's proposed rulemaking, and the Director confirmed that no written comments were received, Mr. Caesar moved that the Board close the public comment period for Agenda Item VI. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Walton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF A BOARD MEMBER AS VICE-CHAIRMAN FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2016.**

After a brief discussion, Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to appoint Stephen C. Walton as vice-chairman for calendar year 2016. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF INDIVIDUALS TO EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE; LEGISLATION AND RULES COMMITTEE; AND INDIVIDUALS TO STANDARDS AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES COMMITTEE WITH CONCURRENT APPOINTMENT AS APPRAISER HEARING OFFICERS FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2016. (Exhibit "K")**

Mr. Walton made a Motion to appoint Donald R. Burris to the Education, Experience, and Testing Committee; Brent W. Stovall to the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee; and Jevon T. Tresner to the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Excused
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Excused
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- IX. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE POLICIES AND PROCEDURES RELATED TO THE ENFORCEMENT OF PROBATION ON A RESPONDENT IN A COMPLAINT FILING TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTTERS OR MOTIONS.** No action. (Exhibit "L")
- X. **NEW BUSINESS.** No action.
- XI. **ADJOURNMENT.** The Board adjourned by general consent.

**OFFICIAL MINUTES.**

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through L.



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Lee R. Caesar Jr.", written over a horizontal line.

**LEE R. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Eric M. Schoen", written over a horizontal line.

**ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD